

## Board of Directors

### Minutes

of meeting held in Magnus House, Aigas Field Centre  
at 7.30pm on Monday 30<sup>th</sup> November 2015

Present		Apologies	In Attendance
John Graham	Andrew Leaver	Peter Smith	Donnie Chisholm
Graeme Scott	Nick Ward		Amanda Bryan
David Garvie	Peter Masheter		
Mark Hedderwick	Calum Fraser		
Anne Forsyth	Warwick Lister-Kaye		

Item	Action
<p>1     <b>Apologies</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Peter Smith</li> </ul>	
<p>2     <b>Declarations of Conflict of Interest</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• WLK noted that he was appointed to the Board by Aigas Field Centre under the terms of the grant for purchase provided by The Aigas Trust. At times WLK will therefore represent Aigas Field Centre in discussions and undertook to inform the Board when this occurs.</li> <li>• Nick Ward noted that he was interested in tendering for the deer control contract with Aigas Community Forest. The Chair thanked Nick for raising this conflict.</li> <li>• Anne Forsyth expressed concern that having a Director hold a contract with Aigas Community Forest could become problematic if they failed to deliver on the terms of the contract and so came into dispute with the organisation. It was noted that this issue needed to be clarified in the proposed Conflict of Interest Policy.</li> <li>• The Chair took the opportunity to discuss the approach he felt the Board should take to discussion around item 6, 'Proposed selection process for deer management contractor'. The paper put forward identifies best practice in tendering based on Scottish Government procurement guidelines. As part of this approach the Chair noted that the discussion should be taken in private where there is a possibility of someone present gaining commercial advantage from hearing the discussions. This would exclude non-Board members and any persons with an interest in tendering for the contract. On this basis the Chair asked Nick Ward to exclude himself from the discussion of item 6 which would be held over to the end of the meeting.</li> <li>• Nick Ward commented that he could not understand why he would need to be excluded from discussion of the content of the tender. After some discussion amongst the Board, Nick agreed to leave for this item.</li> </ul>	

Item	Action
<p><b>3 Minutes of meetings of 21<sup>st</sup> September, 8<sup>th</sup> October and 2<sup>nd</sup> November</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• These minutes had been circulated to the Board in advance.</li> <li>• The Chair noted that there had been an email commenting on the accuracy of the minutes of 21<sup>st</sup> September.</li> <li>• The Chair invited comments on the accuracy of all three sets of minutes. None were forthcoming.</li> <li>• 21<sup>st</sup> September: Proposed – David Garvie; Seconded Calum Fraser</li> <li>• 8<sup>th</sup> October: Proposed – David Garvie; Seconded Calum Fraser</li> <li>• 2<sup>nd</sup> November: Proposed – David Garvie; Seconded John Graham</li> <li>• Andrew Leaver noted that he would like to step down from being minute secretary. No one volunteered to take on the role. Andrew suggested that someone outside the Board be paid to take minutes.</li> </ul>	
<p><b>4 Outstanding actions not covered on the agenda</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• All actions listed with the agenda were discussed: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ 37/5 Woodfuel – still relevant, may become a higher priority as potential for funding by SSE could be investigated</li> <li>○ 37/6 Branding and signage – relevant but not priority. Can be rolled into access and interpretation plans.</li> <li>○ 38/1 Trustee induction – still relevant. Amanda Bryan offered to support this session.</li> <li>○ 38/10 Board skills audit – still relevant. To be undertaken before next meeting.</li> <li>○ 40/1 and 42/1 Insurance – Erik Trelfer has retired and so once home contact details are obtained he will be invited to a meeting to advise on insurance issues.</li> <li>○ 40/2 Mast lease renewal – no response from recent emails to CKD Galbraith. Andrew to phone.</li> <li>○ 40/7 Adopt a phone box – not relevant to ACF; remove.</li> <li>○ 41/2 Woodland Trust application – meeting scheduled for 15<sup>th</sup> December.</li> <li>○ 42/3 Path surveys – see note under item 8.</li> <li>○ 43/1 Community broadband survey – this has been circulated. Members asked to encourage more responses.</li> <li>○ 43/2 and 43/3 Deer control tendering – see item 6.</li> <li>○ 43/4 Design plan scoping consultation – see item 7.</li> <li>○ 43/5 VAT registration – still relevant.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	
<p><b>5 Conflict of Interest Policy</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The draft policy had not been prepared and it was agreed to carry this over to the next meeting.</li> </ul>	

Item	Action
<p>7 <b>Forest Design Plan</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Scoping exercise <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ The scoping has been formally approved by the FCS Conservancy.</li> <li>○ The formal 28-day consultation will be opened on Monday 11<sup>th</sup> January and closed on Sunday 7<sup>th</sup> February.</li> <li>○ Opportunity will be provided on the weekend of 30<sup>th</sup>/31<sup>st</sup> January for the community and stakeholders to discuss the scoping document. This will again be forest-based.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Archaeological survey <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ It was noted that the survey had started with a well-attended session the day prior to the meeting. The Board acknowledged that valuable support of Roland Spencer-Jones and NOSAS.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	DC
<p>6 <b>Access and Recreation</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Path survey <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Anne noted that she has begun the path survey.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Mountain biking <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Donnie noted that a meeting was planned with the mountain bikers on 5<sup>th</sup> December. Mark and Calum indicated they are also planning to attend. Peter Smith also expected to be present.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	
<p>7 <b>Education</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Andrew noted that Teanassie P4-7 class had spent another morning in the Forest support by Donnie and that pupil and teacher feedback was excellent.</li> <li>• The class had potted up small trees to sell at the school Christmas Fayre along with bags of community firewood. Proceeds of both are to be split 50/50.</li> </ul>	
<p>6 <b>Deer Management</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• It was agreed to refer to 'Deer Control' and not 'Deer Management'.</li> </ul> <p><b>Proposed selection process for deer control contractor</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Amanda Bryan and Nick Ward left the meeting prior to this discussion taking place.</li> <li>• The Chair opened discussion on the proposal put forward jointly by him and Andrew Leaver. He noted that the tendering approach and scoring matrix were based on Scottish Government best practice guidelines.</li> <li>• It was commented that the process appeared overly bureaucratic. Graeme accepted this but highlighted that there was significant division on the Board and the situation where a Board member was interested in tendering and so it was important to depersonalise the process and to follow best</li> </ul>	

Item	Action
<p>practice so that the appointment would be open and transparent to all in the community and all those who tender.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>It was agreed that the scoring matrix be used as a guide to help select the top two or three tenders and that these people then be invited for interview. The final decision would then be based on the outcome of the interview and not the top score in the matrix.</li> </ul> <p>The tender questions and scoring matrix weighting for each were discussed and the following agreed.</p> <p><u>Qualifying Selection Criteria</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>At the time of tendering only the name and qualifications of the person leading the contract will be required. The exact qualifications expected will be clarified (firearms licence, DSC1, DSC2, commitment to be in the SNH Fit and Competent Persons register within 12 months of contract)</li> <li>Insurance; no change</li> <li>Health and safety; no change</li> <li>References; no change</li> </ol> <p><u>Qualitative Selection Criteria</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The expectations of the content of the method statement will be provided (including but not limited to: number in team; public signage; use of moderator; times of day; disposal of gralloch; liaison with neighbours; treatment of wounded animals; relationships with game dealers; selection criteria of beasts shot; extraction; transport off site; use of high chairs etc). Weighting applied 40%.</li> <li>Track record; no change. Weighting applied 20%.</li> <li>FSC and SNH standards; removed and included in 1. above.</li> <li>Names and CV of team; removed and included in 1. above.</li> <li>Contribution to monitoring; no change. Weighting applied 20%.</li> <li>Fee structure to be clarified as requesting an explanation of the financial transactions between the contractor and ACF and the flow of income from venison sales. This recognises that there are a number of different options for the stalker to be recompensed. Weighting applied 10%.</li> </ol> <p>There followed discussion about ACF's community based ethos and the stated aim to provide local economic benefit as a result of ACF activity. It was therefore decided to include a scoring criteria that allowed for the delivery of local economic benefit to be selected for.</p> <p>After brief discussion Option 2 in the paper was agreed. This allows for tender submissions to be reviewed by a sub-group with the recommendation being brought back for Board approval. Donnie Chisholm, Peter Masheter and Warwick Lister-Kaye were</p>	

Item	Action
<p>appointed to the group. David Garvie agreed to act as chair.</p> <p>It was agreed that initial sifting of proposals be undertaken 'blind' and so all tenders will be returned to Andrew Leaver to allow names to be removed.</p> <p>Andrew Leaver to redraft tender document based on these discussions and circulate to Board for approval by email.</p> <p>The Board were encouraged to continue to provide Donnie with the names of potential stalkers to increase the pool of people invited to tender.</p>	<p>AL</p>
<p>8      <b>AOCB</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Graeme Scott asked the Board to approve the audited accounts. These were approved and Graeme was thanked for his contribution.</li> <li>• The Community Firewood day had been very successful with several tons chopped and stored in Peter Masheter's barn. Firewood is being delivered to around 15 households and sold by the bag by Teanassie school. Those who attended noted how much they enjoyed getting something practical done in the Forest.</li> <li>• The dates of meetings in 2016 had been circulated by email and are on the website.</li> </ul>	

<b>Summary of Outstanding Actions</b>		
<b>Ref</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Person Responsible</b>
37/5	Bring forward a proposal for a woodfuel business to a future meeting	DC
38/1	Provide a trustee induction session	GS
38/10	Circulate board members skills audit	AL
40/2	Follow up with CKD Galbraith on mast lease renewal.	AL
41/2	Prepare application to The Woodland Trust when required	AL / DC
42/1	Arrange for an insurance expert to attend a future Board meeting.	DC
43/5	Register ACF for VAT	GS
44/1	Initiate formal consultation on scoping document on 11 <sup>th</sup> January and offer community consultation opportunities weekend of 30 <sup>th</sup> /31 <sup>st</sup> January.	DC
44/2	Redraft deer control tender document based on these discussions and circulate to Board for approval by email.	AL